

1                   12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2                                   STATE OF NEW YORK  
3                                   PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
4                                   2025 COMMISSION SESSION  
5

6           DATE:                   DECEMBER 18, 2025 at 10:37 a.m.  
7           LOCATION:                AGENCY 3 BUILDING, 19TH FLOOR  
8                                   EMPIRE STATE PLAZA  
9                                   ALBANY, NEW YORK 12223

10           COMMISSIONERS:

11                                   RORY M. CHRISTIAN, Chair  
12                                   COMMISSIONER JAMES S. ALESI  
13                                   COMMISSIONER DAVID J. VALESKY  
14                                   COMMISSIONER UCHENNA S. BRIGHT  
15                                   COMMISSIONER DENISE M. SHEEHAN  
16                                   COMMISSIONER RADINA R. VALOVA

17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Reported by Zeeshan Riaz

1 12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2 (The hearing commenced at 10:37 a.m.)

3 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Good morning. I  
4 call this session of the Public Service Commission to  
5 order. Madam Secretary, are there any changes to the  
6 final agenda?

7 SECRETARY PHILLIPS: There are no  
8 changes to the final agenda.

9 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you. I would  
10 like to note that Commissioner Maggiore will not be  
11 joining us today due to an excused absence. Before  
12 moving to the agenda, I will conduct a roll call of  
13 Commissioners. When I call your name, please confirm  
14 that you are present.

15 Commissioner James Alesi.

16 COMMISSIONER ALESI: Present.

17 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Commissioner David  
18 Valesky.

19 COMMISSIONER VALESKY: Here.

20 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Commissioner Uchenna  
21 Bright.

22 COMMISSIONER BRIGHT: Here.

23 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Commissioner Dennis  
24 Sheehan.

25 COMMISSIONER SHEEHAN: Present.

1 12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Commissioner Radina  
3 Valova.

4 COMMISSIONER VALOVA: Here.

5 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you. Before  
6 we move to the regular agenda, do any Commissioners  
7 wish to recuse from voting on Item 301 or 501?

8 Commissioner Alesi.

9 COMMISSIONER ALESI: No.

10 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Commissioner  
11 Valesky.

12 COMMISSIONER VALESKY: No.

13 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Commissioner Bright.

14 COMMISSIONER BRIGHT: No.

15 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Commissioner  
16 Sheehan.

17 COMMISSIONER SHEEHAN: No.

18 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Commissioner Valova.

19 COMMISSIONER VALOVA: No.

20 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you. We'll  
21 now move to the first item for discussion in the  
22 regular agenda. Item 301, case 25-E-0764, as it  
23 relates to New York City Reliability Planning. It  
24 will be presented today by Tammy Mitchell. Rob  
25 Habermann, Marco Padula, and Dave Drexler are

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2 available for questions.

3           Tammy, please begin.

4           MS. MITCHELL: Good morning, Chair  
5 Christian and Commissioners. The draft order before  
6 you recommends the Commission direct Consolidated  
7 Edison Company of New York, Inc., or Con Edison, to  
8 develop a reliability contingency plan to address  
9 reliability needs anticipated to affect New York  
10 City. This recommendation arises from staff's review  
11 of recent projections from system reliability studies  
12 performed by the New York ISO and by Con Edison.

13           The aim of these reliability  
14 assessments is to proactively identify reliability  
15 needs for action well before the needs become  
16 critical. In October, the New York ISO issued its  
17 third-quarter Short-Term Assessment of Reliability,  
18 or STAR report, and identified reliability needs  
19 arising as early as next year in both New York City  
20 and on Long Island. As required under its tariff,  
21 the New York ISO has initiated a solicitation for  
22 near-term solutions to the needs highlighted in the  
23 STAR report.

24           The New York ISO also recently  
25 published its ten-year, 2025 to 2034 Comprehensive

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2 Reliability Plan, which concludes that New York's  
3 aging generation fleet, the rapid growth of new large  
4 loads, and the challenges with developing new  
5 dispatchable resources are leading to long-term  
6 system adequacy issues. In addition, on December  
7 3rd, Con Edison presented its 2025 Local Transmission  
8 Plan, or LTP, to the New York ISO stakeholders that  
9 identifies a reliability need during peak hour summer  
10 periods beginning in 2030. Taken together, the STAR  
11 Report, Comprehensive Reliability Plan, and Con  
12 Edison's LTP highlight structural issues that require  
13 intervention now to avoid reliability shortfalls  
14 arising in the early 2030s.

15           Let me provide some background on  
16 electric system planning in New York State. There  
17 are three key elements of the State's reliability  
18 planning process. The New York Independent System  
19 Operator, New York ISO, essentially has two  
20 reliability planning processes, a long-term one and a  
21 short-term one. And the New York State electric  
22 utility companies have what is called a local  
23 transmission planning process. The New York ISO's  
24 long term reliability planning process is performed  
25 biannually and has two parts, a reliability needs

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2           assessment, or RNA, which determines if there is a  
3           reliability need on the bulk system, and a  
4           comprehensive reliability plan, or CRP, which, as the  
5           name indicates, is a plan to address any identified  
6           need.

7                           This long-term reliability planning  
8           process is a ten-year outlook. The other New York  
9           ISO planning process is the Short-Term Assessment of  
10          Reliability, or STAR, which is performed quarterly  
11          and looks out five years. The third element is the  
12          Utilities Local Transmission Planning Process,  
13          whereby each of the utilities analyzes its system by  
14          looking at forecast load, available resources, and  
15          any expected system upgrades and assesses whether  
16          there is or may be a reliability need. The results  
17          of the utility's local transmission plans feed into  
18          the New York ISO Reliability Planning Process.

19                          In its most recent Reliability Needs  
20          Assessment, which was in 2024, the New York ISO  
21          identified an actionable reliability need beginning  
22          in 2033, which was within the ten-year planning time  
23          frame. However, subsequently there was an update to  
24          the demand forecast which eliminated the projected  
25          need, and as a result of that update, no action was

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2           needed or taken by the New York ISO. Importantly  
3           though, the Comprehensive Reliability Plan released  
4           by the New York ISO in November 2025, highlighted  
5           various factors that are leading to long-term system  
6           adequacy issues.

7                         These include the age of existing --  
8           the existing generation fleet. And I'll just note  
9           that currently in its planning studies, the New York  
10          ISO, as well as the utilities, assume that generation  
11          that is currently operating will continue to operate  
12          throughout the planning period unless there is an  
13          announced retirement of a specific unit. The second  
14          factor contributing to long-term system adequacy  
15          issues is the rapid growth of large loads in the  
16          State, as well as rapidly increasing load in general  
17          due to electrification.

18                        And finally, difficulty in developing  
19          new dispatchable resources as existing dispatchable  
20          resources retire. Furthermore, the CRP finds it  
21          extremely likely that significant reliability  
22          shortfalls will arise within the next ten years. As  
23          I mentioned, in October, the New York ISO released  
24          the results of its 2025 third-quarter short-term  
25          Assessment of Reliability Report, which identified

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2       several short-term reliability needs. Specifically,  
3       the report indicated that with the retirement of the  
4       Gowanus and Narrows generating units, and along with  
5       all other assumptions, there would be deficiencies in  
6       both New York City and on Long Island beginning as  
7       soon as 2026 and continuing through 2030.

8                       Pursuant to its tariff, on November  
9       10th, 2025, the New York ISO issued a solicitation  
10      for solutions to the short-term needs identified in  
11      the third-quarter STAR. Responses to that  
12      solicitation are due January 9th. At the same time,  
13      the New York ISO's tariff requires the responsible  
14      transmission owners, which in this case are Con  
15      Edison for the New York City area and Long Island  
16      Power Authority, or LIPA for Long Island, to submit a  
17      backstop solution to address the identified need.  
18      Following the submission of responses, the New York  
19      ISO will issue a report and will indicate the  
20      selection of a solution or combination of solutions  
21      to address the need.

22                      On December 3rd, Con Edison presented  
23      its Local Transmission Plan. In its LTP, Con Edison  
24      identified reliability needs over the next ten years.  
25      The company projects a need in New York City of 250

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2 megawatts beginning in 2030, which increases to 1,325  
3 megawatts in 2035. This need will occur during peak  
4 hours, which today are the hottest summer days, and  
5 will last up to four hours in the early years and as  
6 many as twelve hours in the later years. Similar to  
7 what the New York ISO noted in its Comprehensive  
8 Reliability Plan, Con Edison states that its  
9 reliability needs are being driven by various  
10 factors, including increasing demand due to vehicle  
11 and building electrification and new business, as  
12 well as generator retirements and the lack of new  
13 generation resources.

14           I'll just note there is a relationship  
15 between Con Edison's LTP and the New York ISO STAR in  
16 that proposed solutions to the New York ISO STAR  
17 solicitation could affect the reliability  
18 deficiencies on the Con Ed system. However, it is  
19 unlikely that the New York ISO solution will address  
20 the larger, longer-term need identified by Con Edison  
21 in its LTP. I'll pause here just to emphasize that  
22 these reliability needs are being identified under  
23 stringent reliability criteria. In particular, Con  
24 Edison plans its system such that it is capable of  
25 withstanding the two biggest contingencies during

1 12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2 summer peak demand period -- periods, and still is  
3 able to serve all customer load.

4 The contingencies in this case would  
5 be the loss of the Ravenswood 3 generating unit and  
6 the Champlain Hudson Power Express transmission line.  
7 The strict reliability planning criteria are based on  
8 the dense urban nature of New York City and intended  
9 to ensure a high level of reliability. Staff  
10 believes it is of paramount importance to plan the  
11 system to meet the electrical needs of the area in  
12 the case of the loss of these resources to avoid  
13 adverse consequences to public health, safety, and  
14 the economy that could result from an outage.

15 The draft order before you  
16 acknowledges these projections from the New York ISO  
17 and Con Edison, as well as the Commission's core  
18 responsibility to ensure that customers have reliable  
19 service at just and reasonable rates. It is  
20 incumbent on the Commission, faced with credible  
21 projections for serious reliability shortfalls, to  
22 act to protect the near and long-term reliability of  
23 the system. Therefore, the draft order directs Con  
24 Edison, as the utility responsible for the New York  
25 City system, to develop a propo -- to develop

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2 proposed solutions to the reliability needs it  
3 reported in its LTP.

4           As a first step, the draft order  
5 directs the company to file its assessment of the  
6 reliability need with supporting data and explanation  
7 of the assumptions Con Edison uses to arrive at its  
8 conclusions. This would be due within thirty days of  
9 the date of the order, should you issue it. Con  
10 Edison is further required to update that assessment  
11 on a six-month cycle so that the Commission, the  
12 public, and interested stakeholders can follow the  
13 evolution of the reliability needs and potential --  
14 potential solutions over time.

15           In addition, the draft order calls for  
16 Con Edison to develop potential solutions in a  
17 reliability contingency plan. The draft order before  
18 you sets out the following steps for the development  
19 of the plan. Within thirty days, Con Edison must  
20 issue a Request For Information, or RFI, seeking  
21 solutions to the identified reliability needs. These  
22 may or may not be structured as market-based  
23 proposals. As soon as practicable after the issuance  
24 of the RFI, Con Edison must host a technical  
25 conference to engage with stakeholders and developers

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2           on the identified reliability needs and the RFI.

3                         Within 180 days of the issuance of  
4           this order, Con Edison must file the Reliability  
5           Contingency Plan with its recommendations for  
6           potential solutions to the identified reliability  
7           needs, as well as a description of any measures Con  
8           Edison proposes to take on its own. Thereafter, the  
9           Commission will issue a public notice soliciting  
10          comments on the proposed New York City Reliability  
11          Contingency Plan. The draft order also establishes a  
12          set of principles and technical considerations Con  
13          Edison must apply in developing the New York City  
14          Reliability Contingency Plan.

15                        The principles guiding the plan  
16          include the following. Only nonemitting solutions  
17          consistent with State policy will be considered. The  
18          plan should prioritize solutions that are cost  
19          effective, straightforward to deploy, and capable of  
20          being implemented in a timely manner with a high  
21          level of assurance. And the plan should prioritize  
22          solutions that avoid or minimize impacts to  
23          disadvantaged communities.

24                        Technical considerations include the  
25          requirements to identify the specific points in time

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2 when, for planning purposes, proposed solutions will  
3 need to be online to address the identified  
4 transmission security constraints, provide a  
5 description of the major milestones that could be  
6 used to measure the progress of the solutions  
7 selected for the New York City reliability need,  
8 identify and assess the generation, transmission, and  
9 other resources that are currently under development  
10 that could, when completed, contribute to meeting the  
11 identified reliability need, and describe the  
12 assumptions Con Edison used to evaluate the various  
13 resources considered in the effort to identify  
14 potential solutions.

15                       Following the filing, staff will  
16 evaluate the proposals and comments and make  
17 recommendations to the Commission for action on the  
18 plan. Next steps may include the issuance of one or  
19 more request for proposals seeking specific  
20 investment-quality proposals from among the potential  
21 solutions identified through the RFI process.  
22 Additionally, given similar reliability needs  
23 identified on Long Island by the New York ISO, the  
24 order encourages LIPA to conduct a similar planning  
25 exercise and to develop a Long Island Contingency

1 12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2 Plan that reflects the principles and technical  
3 considerations in this order.

4 This concludes my presentation, and  
5 staff is available for questions.

6 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you, Tammy,  
7 for this presentation. You know, what's clear from  
8 the discussion, and what I hope everyone listening  
9 understands, is that the reliability of our energy  
10 system is of the utmost importance. And today's  
11 order is a testament to that. There's no one-size-  
12 fits-all definition of reliability. And in fact, we  
13 look across the State of New York and the different  
14 geographies we see different levels of reliability  
15 being applied and requirements being applied.

16 Thinking back to the 1950s, in New  
17 York City, as we saw what was a period of rampant  
18 load growth driven by air conditioner use, the need  
19 to have these more stringent reliability standards  
20 became very clear shortly after a blackout. Now,  
21 today, we recognize the need to repeat and avoid such  
22 conditions occurring again, and thus direct Con Ed to  
23 take the actions in this order today. And these  
24 actions are to be done in coordination with and in  
25 consideration of the actions identified through the

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2           ongoing NYISO process.

3                         Now, ensuring reliability comes from  
4           being open to changing assumptions and allowing  
5           policy and regulation to develop at the pace the  
6           moment demands. Regulation is not a monolith. It's  
7           a playbook and a toolbox that changes as the game,  
8           the players, and the field all evolve. It also means  
9           welcoming innovation, both in standards and in  
10          partnerships, as a necessary companion to these  
11          efforts.

12                        So as we explore solutions to the need  
13          identified, we'll also need to explore new options  
14          and new opportunities to enhance reliability created  
15          through the ongoing integration of customer-sited  
16          energy efficiency, demand response, battery storage,  
17          renewable energy, and other measures. Reliability is  
18          upheld by the work of us as regulators, the work of  
19          our utilities, through the work of innovators,  
20          electric generators, developers, and other  
21          stakeholders. This is an all-hands approach. And  
22          the constellation of these players working together  
23          means embracing the challenge of constantly  
24          realigning and consistently recalibrating based on  
25          the new information and factors outside of any of our

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2   individual control. It requires a shared trust and a  
3   shared accountability.

4           So it's important to keep in mind that  
5   the call to action by NYISO and Con Ed are features  
6   of a process with a long history, a process for which  
7   all parties involved have a long track record of  
8   success. And throughout this process -- throughout  
9   the process enabled by this order, we'll review the  
10  various assumptions made, assumptions concerning load  
11  growth as well as assumptions concerning the  
12  management and operation of the electric grid, and  
13  we'll take a variety of steps to ensure that the  
14  actions following this order rise to meet the  
15  challenge ahead.

16           We'll also work to ensure that these  
17  actions and the proposed solutions exhibit the  
18  innovation, expertise, creativity, and real-world  
19  usefulness commensurate to the capabilities and  
20  caliber required during this time. The solutions  
21  must be based in reality, and we are fortunate to  
22  have new systems in place capable of shepherding  
23  these solutions. Most notably among such new  
24  systems, I anticipate and expect that Con Ed's  
25  customer service system will implement new customer

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2 programs, create new rate options, and provide the  
3 necessary data to analyze customer energy profiles to  
4 provide targeted demand response, distributed energy,  
5 resource, and energy efficiency offerings to  
6 customers, all of which together will lead to the  
7 development of enabling tools and services that can  
8 help Con Ed better understand and manage the energy  
9 needs and costs.

10                   Now, we'll see how the system can be  
11 used to leverage nonemitting actions that can  
12 collectively blunt the severity of the reliability  
13 need identified. And this is important because a  
14 cookie cutter approach will not meet this moment.  
15 The conditions we are experiencing today are  
16 unprecedented in scale and scope. And will put to  
17 test the wisdom of past investments. I believe our  
18 utilities can rise to this challenge and look forward  
19 to the results of their work. Thank you.

20                   Commissioner Alesi.

21                   COMMISSIONER ALESI: Thank you, Mr.  
22 Chairman. Thank you for the hard work and the  
23 excellent report. I have no questions or comments.

24                   CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

25                   Commissioner Valesky.

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2                           COMMISSIONER VALESKY: Thank you,  
3 Chair. Thanks, Tammy, and Rob, and Marco, and -- and  
4 David for all -- for all your work in -- in putting  
5 this together and bringing it before us. And Tammy,  
6 thank you for taking the extra time to go through  
7 what is going on around this question. The ISO has  
8 their process. Con Ed has already begun their local  
9 transmission process, I think December 3rd, you said  
10 their submission. So there's a lot going on in this  
11 sphere of reliability. So appreciate you walking us  
12 through that.

13                           I just have one question. And then  
14 a -- a general comment about -- about the order and  
15 about the timing of the order. So the order --  
16 ninety-five percent or so of the order is about New  
17 York City reliability and Con Ed. But as you  
18 indicated in -- in your -- in your presentation, the  
19 order also encourages LIPA to take similar action  
20 with their utility, PSEG Long Island, as a result of  
21 reliability concerns on Long Island. Can -- can you  
22 just -- can you just share with us what -- what  
23 oversight do you as the Department and/or us as the  
24 Commission, have to ensure that the encouragement of  
25 LIPA that is in this order, is actually followed? Do

1 12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2 we have a mechanism to monitor, shall we say?

3 MS. MITCHELL: I'll defer to my  
4 attorney.

5 MR. DREXLER: Well, DPS is very active  
6 with LIPA, and we would be engaging with them to make  
7 sure that they're taking the appropriate actions.  
8 But in terms of like, a legal, you know, hook, we do  
9 not have a direct, you know --

10 COMMISSIONER VALESKY: Sure.

11 MR. DREXLER: -- authority to order  
12 them to take --

13 COMMISSIONER VALESKY: Sure, sure.

14 MR. DREXLER: -- direct actions.

15 COMMISSIONER VALESKY: Understood.  
16 Understood. But I think it's important what you --  
17 you have said that outside of any legal action that  
18 we can take, you will certainly be diligent in --  
19 in -- in ensuring that this is not just a sentence or  
20 two in an order that will be considered shortly.

21 MR. DREXLER: Yeah. Absolutely,  
22 Commissioner.

23 COMMISSIONER VALESKY: Okay. Okay.  
24 Thank you very much. The -- the comment, it's just  
25 the -- the timing, I think could, not be more

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2     appropriate. We are forty-eight hours or so from the  
3     State having passed the first state energy plan in  
4     several years. And Chair, you were certainly a  
5     member of that board and should be commended for your  
6     efforts in that role.

7           I want to just share very briefly,  
8     because it strikes me as being incredibly appropriate  
9     at this time and as we take up this order, the energy  
10    plan itself has a lot in it, and many of us will  
11    continue to -- to peruse it and -- and -- and digest  
12    it. But it also included a -- a cover letter from  
13    the Governor. And -- and I think it's important that  
14    this is all public information, but there's something  
15    in particular that struck me from that letter, and I  
16    just want to pull one paragraph from that, because it  
17    speaks to me about how important what we are doing  
18    here today.

19           And she's talking about the energy  
20    plan and -- and being a realistic assessment of where  
21    we are in a roadmap for where we need to go. This  
22    paragraph struck me where she says, "First and  
23    foremost is reliability. Our energy system is the  
24    backbone of our entire economy. It powers our  
25    hospitals, subways, farms, factories, and homes. And

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2       we're operating one of the oldest, most complex grids  
3       in the nation at a time when demand is rising fast.  
4       Advanced manufacturing, new housing, and exciting  
5       research all require more energy. Meanwhile, climate  
6       change is bringing storms, heat waves, and blizzards  
7       that strain our system even further. In recent  
8       years, we've come uncomfortably close to shortages.  
9       I will not risk rolling blackouts or gas outages.  
10      This plan reflects that urgency". Let me just repeat  
11      "I will not risk rolling blackouts or gas outages".  
12      Neither will this Commission. I support the order.  
13      Thank you.

14                   CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.  
15                   Commissioner Bright.

16                   COMMISSIONER BRIGHT: Thank you, Mr.  
17      Chairman. And thank you, Tammy, and Rob, and Marco,  
18      and David for all of your hard work and for bringing  
19      this item before us. I'm really pleased to see this  
20      action come before the Commission. You know, the  
21      situation we're in is very dynamic, and I feel like  
22      we've had to pivot in many ways. Some of the things  
23      that were supposed to come to fruition over the last  
24      five years particularly haven't, and more recently,  
25      there's felt like there's been sort of an assault

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2     from all sides where things that seem certain are a  
3     lot less so.

4                     So I -- I -- I don't have any  
5     questions, but you know, my comment is really that we  
6     have many needs and we have to meet those needs. And  
7     the question is how. We know we cannot reach our  
8     targets and commitments without Zone J. We know  
9     we'll need more than the renewable generation  
10    currently slated to be coming from Canada or upstate.  
11    We're still fighting for our offshore wind resources  
12    as a state. And that situation is dynamic. So if  
13    those leases get restarted tomorrow, great. But what  
14    can we do today? That is the question.

15                    And lately, I've seen a lot of  
16    misinformation -- some of the Commissions -- on some  
17    of the Commission's recent decisions, particularly on  
18    the offshore wind PPTN and because the Clean Path  
19    Project did not qualify as a priority transmission  
20    project. People keep saying we canceled it, which is  
21    not what happened. But as we moved forward -- as we  
22    moved forward with each one of those decisions, I  
23    recall very explicitly expressing my concern during  
24    session for Zone J. And to me, this action, if it  
25    gets approved today, would be a giant leap forward in

1 12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2 how we might really start tackling this issue with  
3 near-term solutions to match the need.

4 I think this order makes it clear that  
5 this is an all-hands on deck moment like the Chair  
6 said, and it is extremely important that it's not  
7 being done in a silo. Of course, all the  
8 Commission's actions have public comment, but in this  
9 case, we're also ensuring Con Ed not only come up  
10 with its own solutions, but that they also issue an  
11 RFP for solutions, which means expanding -- we're  
12 expanding our universe of possibilities. So I'm very  
13 pleased to support this item, and I do so without  
14 reservation. Thank you.

15 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

16 Commissioner Sheehan.

17 COMMISSIONER SHEEHAN: Thank you,  
18 Chair.

19 Thank you, Tammy. Great job. And to  
20 the team, I know this was a lot of work in a short  
21 period, so thank you for all of your efforts.

22 Like my fellow Commissioners, I think  
23 this is an essential first step. Or not even a first  
24 step, one of many steps, I think that's essential,  
25 and I think it will be part -- an important part of

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2     the reliability puzzle. I think it's going to be  
3     important how we and Con Ed work with the ISO on  
4     developing solutions. I think that's something that  
5     we have to really keep an eye on. And I would just  
6     ask staff to keep us up to date, you know, trying to  
7     manage keeping track of both of those processes.

8           It would be -- I think it's going to  
9     be important to see what comes out of the -- the ISO  
10    process, what solutions they -- they suggest in the  
11    near term, how that dovetails with Con Ed's proposed  
12    solutions. You know, this is obviously, as everybody  
13    has said, it's dynamic and fluid. But the  
14    relationship between the Department, the Commission,  
15    and the ISO in this particular case is extremely  
16    crucial. So I want us to just -- I would just ask  
17    that you keep us informed and -- and engage on that  
18    question.

19           So the one thing I do want to just  
20    note is that this is a part of the puzzle. I do  
21    think that there may be additional measures that are  
22    not envisioned in this order that may become  
23    necessary. So I just want to put that out there. As  
24    Commissioner Bright noted, we as a Commission noted  
25    in the -- in the case 22-E-0633, which is the New

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2    York City PPTN, we expect -- you know, we  
3    specifically included some language. So this is  
4    where I -- I do want to encourage us to work beyond  
5    just this Department.

6           As we said, in that order, staff  
7    should work with our sister state agencies NYSERDA  
8    NYPA to identify solutions to incorporate into --  
9    into reliability planning processes to meet  
10   reliability needs. I would just add that I -- I see  
11   the potential to leverage some of our state programs  
12   and initiatives that are underway to -- to do and  
13   take complementary measures to support the -- the  
14   reliabilities and the reliability need in Zone J and  
15   K. And so the idea that just the Con Ed reliability  
16   plan is going to do it all, I think we have a  
17   responsibility as a Department, as a Commission, to  
18   make sure all of our actions fit together. all of the  
19   State agencies are working together to solve this --  
20   to solve this problem.

21           So I just wanted to note that that  
22    I -- I think we want to remember our -- our sister  
23    agencies are part of the solution here also. With  
24    respect to the -- the RFI that we are requiring from  
25    Con Ed. I -- I do want to emphasize that I'm hopeful

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2           that they will seek market-based solutions,  
3           engagement from the private sector, leveraging  
4           private investment to ensure we have least cost  
5           solutions. So I wanted to stress that.

6                         And then my last point that I -- that  
7           is incredibly important to me, and I think actually  
8           adds a lot of value to this process, is ensuring that  
9           we have a robust stakeholder process. I appreciate  
10          that this initiating order requires Con Ed to host a  
11          technical conference after their initial projections  
12          are -- are complete and submitted, and their initial  
13          RFI is prepared so that they can get some initial  
14          responses and share their intentions. And I -- I  
15          think as a former stakeholder, it's a very -- it's a  
16          meaningful thing for stakeholders to be engaged in.  
17          So I would just ask that once the initial plan is  
18          also submitted, that we continue to engage with  
19          stakeholders. You know, this -- the initial plan  
20          we're requesting from Con Ed, asks for proposed  
21          solutions, proposed regulatory changes. And those  
22          things are not minor. So understanding those beyond  
23          just a written submission, I think, would be -- it  
24          would be beneficial to have another technical  
25          conference at that time. Obviously, that's six

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2 months down the road. So I'm just encouraging that  
3 as part of the process.

4           I think those are my suggestions. I  
5 certainly support the item. And I support the  
6 efforts. I shared the concerns that everyone else  
7 shared.

8           And Commissioner Valesky, I printed  
9 out the same letter, the Governor's letter, with the  
10 state energy plan.

11           And obviously, I want to reiterate,  
12 that I don't want to risk rolling blackouts or gas  
13 outages, either. And I support the item. Thank you.

14           CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

15           Commissioner Valova?

16           COMMISSIONER VALOVA: I echo all of my  
17 colleagues' statements, and appreciate staff's work  
18 on this. I think, any opportunity we have to apply a  
19 thoughtful strategic planning process to arrive at  
20 cost-effective solutions is good. And it's -- it's  
21 the right approach. I would generally like to note,  
22 that words can be a little tricky. So I very  
23 strongly support the guiding principles, that  
24 solutions have to be cost-effective, and  
25 straightforward to deploy, and capable of being

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2     implemented in a timely manner. But I do want to  
3     caution, that straightforward is open to  
4     interpretation. And that, I think, what it doesn't  
5     mean is, necessarily limiting prioritized solutions  
6     to the lowest hanging fruit, or very easy to  
7     implement solutions. I think what it really means is  
8     reliable solutions. Solutions that the company can  
9     expect to provide consistently the reliability  
10    services that that solution is intended to provide,  
11    whether it's a demand side or demand management  
12    solution or a traditional solution. That it's going  
13    to perform as expected in order to address the  
14    reliability needs.

15                   And I think, it's -- it's fair to say,  
16    that within the utility industry, Con Edison is  
17    perceived as being one of the more forward-looking  
18    innovative utilities. And so I will expect nothing  
19    short of excellence from the company in -- in  
20    identifying and prioritizing flexible resources where  
21    possible, virtual power plants, energy storage, other  
22    flexible solutions, in addition to any traditional  
23    infrastructure solutions that the company may -- may  
24    propose. And with that, I will be supporting the  
25    item. Thank you.

1 12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

3 With that, I'll conduct a call for a  
4 vote. My vote is in favor of the recommendations  
5 outlined in the draft order.

6 Commissioner Alesi, how do you vote?

7 COMMISSIONER ALESI: I vote yes.

8 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

9 Commissioner Valesky?

10 COMMISSIONER VALESKY: Yes.

11 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

12 Commissioner Bright?

13 COMMISSIONER BRIGHT: Yes.

14 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

15 Commissioner Sheehan?

16 COMMISSIONER SHEEHAN: Yes.

17 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

18 Commissioner Valova?

19 COMMISSIONER VALOVA: Yes.

20 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

21 The item is approved. And the  
22 recommendations are adopted. Thank you, everyone.

23 We'll now move on to the second item  
24 for discussion today.

25 (Pause)

1 12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: You may want to  
3 switch your name tags Val and Brian. There we go.  
4 Okay. As mentioned, we're now on our second item for  
5 discussion. Item 501, Case 24-C-0618, as it relates  
6 to the petition of Verizon Communications and  
7 Frontier Communications for transfer of ownership.  
8 It will be presented today by Brian Ossias. Valery  
9 Galasso, Brandon Goodrich, and Jeff Hogan will be  
10 available for questions.

11 Brian, please begin.

12 MR. OSSIAS: Thank you, Chair, and  
13 good morning.

14 And good morning, Commissioners.

15 Before I begin, I would like to  
16 acknowledge and thank the department staff team that  
17 worked on this case for their hard work and effort.

18 The team is comprised of members from  
19 the Office of General Counsel, Telecommunications,  
20 Regulatory Economics, and Accounting Audits and  
21 Finance. Today, I, along with Valery Galasso, are  
22 recommending adoption of a draft order that approves  
23 the indirect transfer of control of the Frontier  
24 operating companies in New York, to Verizon  
25 Communications, Inc., subject to the unconditional

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2 acceptance of a series of enforceable conditions. I  
3 will briefly describe the public interest service  
4 laws, public interest standard of review that applies  
5 here, along with the risk mitigation measures  
6 recommended and some of the enumerated incremental  
7 public benefits. Valery will then describe the  
8 affordability conditions, the small business,  
9 education, and digital divide investments, and the  
10 nondiscrimination conditions imposed in the draft  
11 order. We, along with Brandon Goodrich, Jeff Hogan,  
12 and Richard Schuler will be available for any  
13 questions at the conclusion of our presentation.

14           The Petitioners have represented in  
15 their filings, that the -- that the change in  
16 ownership will be seamless for New York customers of  
17 the Frontier operating companies. According to the  
18 petition, the corporate identities, authorizations,  
19 rights, obligations, rates, and services of the  
20 Frontier operating companies will not change as a  
21 result of the transaction. Nevertheless, on November  
22 24th, 2025, the Petitioners filed an amended  
23 supplement to their joint petition describing  
24 specific public interest protections and benefits  
25 that they would be willing to undertake if the

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2           transaction is ultimately approved. For its  
3           approval, the Commission must first find, that the  
4           transaction is in the public interest.

5                     Public Service Law Section 99 requires  
6           the consent of the Commission for any proposed  
7           transfer of a telephone corporation's works or  
8           systems. As the Commission has noted, although  
9           Public Service Law Section 99 does not specify a  
10          standard of review, all such utility transfers have  
11          been interpreted as requiring an -- an affirmative  
12          public interest determination by the Commission.

13                    Public Service Law Section 100  
14          requires the Commission's consent for the acquisition  
15          of the stock of a telephone corporation. Unlike  
16          Section 99, however, these provisions expressly bar  
17          the Commission from giving its consent, unless the  
18          applicant has shown in the first instance, that the  
19          acquisition is in the public interest. Similar to  
20          other transfers, the public interest standard is  
21          interpreted as requiring a demonstration of  
22          quantifiable net-positive benefits for New York  
23          customers, but only after mitigating any identified  
24          potential risks or harms.

25                    Turning to the potential risks or

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2       harms of the proposed transaction. As part of its  
3       review, department staff analyzed the financial  
4       performances of the Frontier New York operating  
5       companies, the Frontier parent, and Verizon  
6       Communications, as well as the service quality  
7       performance of the Frontier New York operating  
8       subsidiaries. In doing so department staff  
9       identified certain financial and service quality  
10      concerns, that in turn, require specific conditions  
11      to ensure New York customers are protected. Chief  
12      among them is the imposition of a minimum common  
13      equity ratio of fifty percent for the Frontier New  
14      York operating companies, to ensure there is adequate  
15      capital at the operating subsidiary level, as well as  
16      a financial covenant-leverage ratio for the Frontier  
17      parent to ensure money is available should those  
18      circumstances change.

19                   Moreover, to ensure adequate --  
20      adequate customer service and network reliability,  
21      the Petitioners should be required to implement all  
22      recommendations resulting from the targeted Frontier  
23      operations audit in Case 24-C-0537, hire an  
24      additional twenty bargaining unit employees in the  
25      Frontier New York territories, and refrain from

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2    laying off, involuntarily reducing, or taking any  
3    action that is intended to reduce customer-facing  
4    jobs or positions in service quality and network  
5    reliability for the Frontier New York operating  
6    subsidiaries for a period of three years following  
7    the closing of the transaction, or completion of the  
8    broadband deployment commitments, which I will  
9    discuss in a second, whichever is required --  
10   whichever is longer. Excuse me.

11                   Additionally, with one year of the  
12    closing of the transaction, and continuing for a  
13    period of at least four years following the closing  
14    of the transaction, the Petitioner shall adopt a  
15    plant maintenance program for the Frontier New York  
16    operating subsidiary service territories, through  
17    which, technicians can submit plant conditions  
18    needing additional maintenance directly to  
19    Petitioners through a system comparable to Verizon's  
20    national operations quality inspection system, that  
21    records and documents such conditions.

22                   As discussed in previous transfers and  
23    mergers, the Commission recognizes, that monetized  
24    benefits, sometimes described as positive benefit  
25    adjustments, or PBA's, are at best an exercise of

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2 informed judgment, because there really is no  
3 mathematical formula on which to base such a  
4 decision. But to ensure that this transaction meets  
5 the positive benefit adjustment test, and is the --  
6 and is in the public interest here, the Commission  
7 should also require enforceable public benefit  
8 conditions.

9           Therefore, as a -- as a condition of  
10 the Commission's approval, the Commission -- excuse  
11 me, the Petitioners should be required to invest  
12 within five years of the closing of the transaction  
13 at least forty-million dollars to extend their fiber  
14 to the premises high-speed broadband network to  
15 unserved or underserved addresses. Those are  
16 addresses that have no provider passing them that is  
17 capable of providing high-speed broadband at this  
18 time. In addition, the Petitioner should be required  
19 to invest at least ninety-million dollars to deploy  
20 their fiber-to-the-premises network to overbuild  
21 addresses within the service territories of both  
22 Verizon and Frontier, to which they have no fiber-to-  
23 the-premises facilities deployed, and that address  
24 has not been awarded BEAD or any other state or  
25 Federal subsidy funding.

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2                   Before I turn it over to Valery, I  
3 would also high -- like to highlight that. All the  
4 conditions contained in the draft order will be  
5 subject to a host of compliance and reporting  
6 requirements, and will be binding and enforceable  
7 upon the petitions, pursuant to Public Service Law  
8 Sections 25 and 26. Moreover, the petitions will  
9 also be required to -- the Petitioners will also be  
10 required to unconditionally accept these conditions  
11 in writing. If the Petitioners do not  
12 unconditionally accept within seven business days of  
13 the issuance of the draft order, the order itself  
14 will constitute a denial of -- of the joint petition.  
15 Finally, if in obtaining approval of the proposed  
16 transaction in any other jurisdiction, the  
17 Petitioners commit to additional benefits, they will  
18 be required to notify the Commission of its intent to  
19 provide those same commitments in New York.

20                   Thank you. Valery?

21                   MS. GALASSO: Thank you, Brian.

22                   It's a pleasure to be before the  
23 Commission again. Chairman and Commissioners, good  
24 morning. I appreciate the opportunity to speak with  
25 you today.

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2                   I'd like to begin with affordability,  
3 which has long been a priority in New York. Access  
4 to broadband is essential for participation in modern  
5 life, for education, work, healthcare, and civic  
6 engagement. And New York has been clear, that  
7 affordability must be at the center of broadband  
8 policy. In that spirit, regardless of whether New  
9 York State's Affordable Broadband Act remains in  
10 effect, Verizon commits, that for a period of at  
11 least five years following the closing of this  
12 transaction, it will continue to offer its Verizon  
13 Forward Program to all eligible customers in both  
14 Frontier and Verizon ILEC service areas, who have  
15 access to either fiber or fixed wireless service.

16                   Verizon Forward offers qualifying New  
17 York households affordable internet under the  
18 Affordable Broadband Act, with plans priced at twenty  
19 dollars per month or less, and speeds of up to 200  
20 megabits per second. Importantly, this commitment  
21 will be made without any reduction in eligibility  
22 criteria or level of discount currently offered in  
23 New York as of the date of closing. In addition, for  
24 that same five-year period, Verizon will invest no  
25 less than \$300,000 annually to raise consumer

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2 awareness for the Verizon Forward program across both  
3 the Verizon Forward ILEC service territories in New  
4 York, and will maintain a dedicated web page to  
5 ensure customers can easily access information about  
6 the program.

7                           Turning now to digital inclusion and  
8 community investments. Consistent with the goal of  
9 closing the digital divide in New York, Verizon,  
10 within six months of the closing of this transaction,  
11 will contribute at least twenty-million dollars  
12 through a state grant. The focus of this grant will  
13 be on increasing capacity to improve digital literacy  
14 and digital job-readiness skills, workforce  
15 development, facilitating access to affordable  
16 internet and devices, enhancing digital privacy, and  
17 making government services more accessible through  
18 the internet. These investments will be made by the  
19 ConnectALL office, a division of the New York State  
20 Urban Development Corporation, also known as Empire  
21 State Development, and in consultation with the  
22 Department.

23                           Verizon has committed to expanding  
24 opportunity for small businesses and communities  
25 across the state. As part of its Small Business

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2 Accelerator program, Verizon will spend five billion  
3 dollars nationally with small business suppliers. Of  
4 that amount, \$150 million will be spent in New York  
5 over five years, following the close of this  
6 transaction. In addition, over the two years  
7 following the transaction's close, Verizon will  
8 invest an additional \$200,000 in grants to New York's  
9 small businesses, through its Small Business Digital  
10 Ready program, along with \$750,000 in funding to  
11 community organizations that support small businesses  
12 in New York. Verizon will also add two new community  
13 partners through this program. Verizon will further  
14 invest one million dollars over the next two years in  
15 its technician training program at Pace University,  
16 helping to develop skilled workforce here in New  
17 York. Over five years, Verizon will invest \$1.5  
18 million in its Community Disaster Resiliency  
19 partnership with the United Way.

20                       Finally, Chairman and Commissioners,  
21 in light of some concerning actions we are seeing at  
22 the Federal level, I want to be clear about the  
23 following commitments that accompany this  
24 transaction. The Petitioners recognize, that they  
25 are bound by, will comply with, will continue to

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2     implement all applicable Federal and New York State  
3     nondiscrimination laws. These include Title VII of  
4     the Civil Rights Act, the Americans with Disabilities  
5     Act, the Age Discrimination in Employment Act, the  
6     Family and Medical Leave Act, the Pregnant Workers  
7     and Fairness Act, the Fair Labor Standards Act, and  
8     all New York State executive law and labor law  
9     protections. The Petitioners will not discriminate  
10    against any prospective or existing employees or  
11    customers with respect to any wireline communication  
12    services offered in New York. And they will  
13    cooperate fully with any New York State agency  
14    investigating allegations of discrimination.

15                   In addition, beginning January 31st,  
16    2027, and for five years following the close of this  
17    transaction, unless extended by the Commission, the  
18    Petitioners will submit an annual report to the  
19    Commission detailing voluntary workforce self-  
20    identification data, and describing the policies and  
21    practices in place, to ensure equal opportunity and  
22    nondiscrimination in recruitment and hiring across  
23    the combined New York companies.

24                   Thank you again for the opportunity to  
25    appear before you today. And I'm happy to answer any

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2 questions.

3                   CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Again, thank you,  
4 Brian. Thank you, Valery, for the presentation.

5                   It's clear from your remarks, that  
6 this action is definitely aligned with the public  
7 interest. And I very much appreciate the emphasis on  
8 affordability that threads itself throughout this  
9 order, along with increased access. So I thank you  
10 for your hard work in bringing this to us, and  
11 getting these outcomes. And I have nothing further  
12 to add. Thank you for your hard work.

13                   Commissioner Alesi?

14                   COMMISSIONER ALESI: Thank you,  
15 Chairman. I'll be supporting this. Good job all the  
16 way through, as usual. This provides a solid degree  
17 of consumer protection. And if nothing else, it is  
18 in the public interest. And I'm pleased, that we'll  
19 go a long way to help close the digital divide as  
20 well. So I'll be supporting it.

21                   CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

22                   Commissioner Valesky?

23                   COMMISSIONER VALESKY: Thank you,  
24 Brian and Valery. No questions from me. You  
25 articulated very clearly the public's -- public-

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2    interest standard that exists in law when we take up  
3    these mergers and acquisitions. And I'm more than  
4    convinced, not only have you met the standard, you've  
5    far exceeded it to the benefit of -- of countless New  
6    Yorkers. So thank you very much for your great work.

7                   CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

8                   Commissioner Bright?

9                   COMMISSIONER BRIGHT: Thank you,  
10 Valery and Brian. There's so much packed in here. I  
11 don't have any questions. But my comment is really  
12 just, in essence, this will allow for investments  
13 that will help continue fiber expansion and the  
14 expansion of high-speed service, which means more  
15 reliable service in more areas and more competition  
16 and more consumer choice. And of course, finally,  
17 more people in -- more people served in unserved and  
18 underserved communities.

19                   So I realized, that all of our orders,  
20 sort of definitely involve all of the -- all of our  
21 offices and many of our offices to finalize. But I  
22 just want to note, that the DPS telecommunications  
23 team has done such an outstanding job, and has done  
24 such ground -- groundbreaking work to map people's  
25 access to high-speed internet, so that we can improve

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2       access. And I look forward to seeing how those --  
3       how the improvements that are packed into this --  
4       this merger may result in more people being served as  
5       we get to -- to review subsequent annual reports.

6                       So thank you so much.

7                       CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

8                       Commissioner Sheehan?

9                       COMMISSIONER SHEEHAN: Thank you,  
10       Brian and Valery and the entire team with tremendous  
11       job. Really, this is a very comprehensive order,  
12       extremely thorough. And you know, just a read of the  
13       order, it -- it checks every box, as -- as my fellow  
14       commissioners have noted. It does ensure  
15       significant -- significant additional investments and  
16       service quality, as well as a portfolio of public  
17       benefits, that include affordable broadband access,  
18       small business assistance, workforce development.  
19       And I appreciate the anti-discrimination protections  
20       that are incorporated in this.

21                      I also was very pleased to see the  
22       inclusion of the requirement to adopt the customer  
23       service recommendations coming out of the audit of  
24       Frontier operations. I do think that will be  
25       critical to current Frontier customers, who at the

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2           end of the day, they're going to hear about this, and  
3           say, what does this mean? And I think, that that to  
4           me is the -- is the key takeaway for -- for Frontier  
5           customers. So I agree, that this action is in the  
6           public interest. And well done. I'll be supporting.  
7           Thank you.

8                           CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.  
9                           And Commissioner Valova?

10                          COMMISSIONER VALOVA: Thank you.

11                          I really appreciate the rigorous  
12           review that you have all conducted of the proposed  
13           transfer, to not only identify potential risks, but  
14           also propose mitigation measures and incremental  
15           public benefits.

16                          I have one clarifying question. What  
17           consequences are there for nonperformance, if the  
18           companies don't implement what they have agreed to,  
19           assuming that the transfer is approved?

20                          MR. GOODRICH: So similar to other  
21           orders of the Commission, the Department has the  
22           ability to require enforcement through court, and  
23           also seek penalty actions under PSL 25. And so there  
24           are those avenues to -- to officially enforce the  
25           Commission's order. Obviously, we -- we expect

1           12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2 Verizon to -- to comply with the order in the first  
3 instance, and/or come into compliance with -- with  
4 less than -- than those actions being necessary.

5           COMMISSIONER VALOVA: Thank you. Yes.  
6 And I -- I share that sentiment as -- as -- as well.  
7 I expect that they will. But it's always good to  
8 know what our avenues of recourse are, if -- if  
9 needed. And with that, I will be supporting this  
10 item. Thank you.

11           CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

12           I'll now conduct a call for a vote.  
13 My vote is in favor of the recommendations contained  
14 in the draft as discussed.

15           Commissioner Alesi, how do you vote?

16           COMMISSIONER ALESI: I vote yes.

17           CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

18           Commissioner Valesky?

19           COMMISSIONER VALESKY: Yes.

20           CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

21           Commissioner Bright?

22           COMMISSIONER BRIGHT: Yes.

23           CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

24           Commissioner Sheehan?

25           COMMISSIONER SHEEHAN: Yes.

1 12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

3 Commissioner Valova?

4 COMMISSIONER VALOVA: Yes.

5 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you. The item  
6 is approved. The recommendations are adopted. Thank  
7 you, everyone.

8 We'll now move to the consent agenda.

9 And I think, I'll take the opportunity  
10 to clarify a point. I received, noticed that there  
11 have been a number of questions regarding item number  
12 261. And I want to clarify, that the Con Ed rate  
13 case is not the final decision on the rate case.  
14 Instead, this is an extension of the suspension  
15 period for rates, to allow for further review of the  
16 comments on the joint proposal. So that is not a  
17 final action by the Commission on the rate case. I  
18 want to make sure that's clear.

19 And I'll move forward, and ask. Do  
20 any commissioners wish to comment on, or recuse from  
21 voting on any items on the consent agenda?

22 And I'll begin with Commissioner  
23 Alesi.

24 COMMISSIONER ALESI: No. I do not.  
25 Thank you.

1 12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

3 Commissioner Valesky?

4 COMMISSIONER VALESKY: No comments or  
5 recusals.

6 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

7 Commissioner Bright?

8 COMMISSIONER BRIGHT: No comments or  
9 recusals. Thank you, Chairman.

10 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

11 Commissioner Sheehan?

12 COMMISSIONER SHEEHAN: Get your pen  
13 out.

14 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: It's out. Let's do  
15 it.

16 COMMISSIONER SHEEHAN: I have several  
17 recusals this -- this session. I'm hoping -- I can't  
18 wait to be at the end of this, but. So 362, 371,  
19 374, 382, and 385.

20 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: You wish to recuse  
21 from --

22 COMMISSIONER SHEEHAN: Correct.

23 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: -- those five items?

24 COMMISSIONER SHEEHAN: Yes. And I  
25 have no comments on the others.

1 12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Okay. And I'll --  
3 I'll repeat the numbers --

4 COMMISSIONER SHEEHAN: Sure.

5 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: -- just for the  
6 record. 362, 371, 374, 382, 385, all items are  
7 recused?

8 COMMISSIONER SHEEHAN: Correct.

9 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you very much.  
10 Okay. And no comments on anything else, correct?

11 COMMISSIONER SHEEHAN: Correct. Thank  
12 you.

13 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

14 Commissioner Valova?

15 COMMISSIONER VALOVA: I would like to  
16 briefly comment on item 169, that's Corning Natural  
17 Gas Corporation's long-term gas plan, to thank all  
18 the staff who worked on that plan and all the  
19 stakeholders who commented. And I think a lot of  
20 work went into it. And I'm very appreciative of  
21 that. And I will be abstaining from item 263.

22 CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.

23 Thank you. Okay. I'll now call for a  
24 vote. My vote is in favor of the recommendations on  
25 the consent agenda.

1                   12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION  
2                   Commissioner Alesi, how do you vote?  
3                   COMMISSIONER ALESI: Yes on all items.  
4                   CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.  
5                   Commissioner Valesky?  
6                   COMMISSIONER VALESKY: Yes on all  
7 items.  
8                   CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.  
9                   Commissioner Bright?  
10                  COMMISSIONER BRIGHT: Yes on all  
11 items.  
12                  CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Thank you.  
13                  Commissioner Sheehan?  
14                  COMMISSIONER SHEEHAN: Yes on all  
15 items, with the exception of 360 through 371, 374,  
16 382, and 385, from which I'm recused.  
17                  CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Excellent. Thank  
18 you.  
19                  And Commissioner Valova?  
20                  COMMISSIONER VALOVA: Yes to all  
21 items, except for item 263, from which I abstain.  
22                  CHAIR CHRISTIAN: Okay. Thank you  
23 very much. The items on the consent agenda are  
24 approved. And the recommendations are adopted.  
25                  Madam Secretary, is there anything

1                   12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2 further to come before us today?

3                   SECRETARY PHILLIPS: There's nothing  
4 further. I just want to wish everyone happy  
5 holidays.

6                   CHAIR CHRISTIAN: I -- I was going to  
7 do that, though.

8                   Happy holidays, everyone.

9                   And with that, I adjourn. Take care.

10

11

12

13                   (The hearing concluded at 11:34 a.m.)

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1                   12/18/2025 - NYS PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

2                   STATE OF NEW YORK

3                   I, ZEESHAN RIAZ, do hereby certify that the foregoing  
4                   was reported by me, in the cause, at the time and  
5                   place, as stated in the caption hereto, at Page 1  
6                   hereof; that the foregoing typewritten transcription  
7                   consisting of pages 1 through 50, is a true record of  
8                   all proceedings had at the hearing.

9   IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto  
10                   subscribed my name, this the 22nd day of December,  
11                   2025.

12

13

14                   ZEESHAN RIAZ, Reporter

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25